



[Redacted]

By email

6 June 2016

Dear [Redacted]

[Redacted]

Thank you for your e-mail, requesting access to information relating to you under the provisions of the Data Protection Act 1998 and a request for information under the terms of the Freedom of Information Act 2000. In your e-mail you asked for the following:

“...for all information related to this appointment (under the FOI Act 2000)

...all personal information held in relation to this appointment (under the DPA 1998)”

### **FOI Act**

As you may appreciate, the exercise to recruit Assistant Commissioners was an extensive one, and involved much administration and practical arrangements. The BCE holds a significant amount of correspondence and information relating to such matters, such as:

1. Contact with the sponsor department agreeing the process for the recruitment of the Assistant Commissioners (as these are technically ministerial appointments);
2. Arranging and agreeing the advertising of the posts externally through an agency;
3. The recruitment of and arrangements for an independent panellist to sit on the interview panel;
4. Discussions between the Secretariat, sponsor department and the BCE finalising the recruitment of the Assistant Commissioners.

Although we have not estimated the amount of time that it would take to retrieve and prepare this information (as well as applying any exemptions necessary), it is likely to take a significant amount of time and may invoke the exemption related to fee limits.

Instead, in order to best assist you with your query, we have concentrated on your clarification of what information you are particularly interested in, namely:

“information relating to the shortlisting process, how the shortlist was put together and the number and breakdown of applicants. I am also interested in anything else which might explain why I failed to meet the criteria”

The method for sifting candidates used a scoring system where the scores awarded ranged from 0 to 3, against each of the six essential criteria listed in the recruitment pack. An explanation of the scoring system is below:

- 0 is “Not met”;
- 1 is “Evidence provided that part met the requirements of the post”;
- 2 is “Evidence provided fully met the requirements of the post”;
- 3 is “Evidence provided exceeded the requirements of the post”.

Each of the essential criteria was scored using this method, for each candidate. As a reminder the six essential criteria were as follows:

1. Integrity and independence of mind;
2. Ability to explain procedures, and produce clear and succinct analyses and evidence-based recommendations, both orally and in writing;
3. Ability to inspire respect and confidence, and to maintain authority when challenged, particularly in a public hearing context;
4. Ability to treat everyone with respect and sensitivity whatever their background and to demonstrate patience, courtesy and tact when dealing with the general public;
5. Ability to work accurately at speed and under pressure, quickly absorbing detail, and analysing large quantities of information objectively;
6. Ability to work well as part of a team with the BCE’s Secretariat and one or more other Assistant Commissioners.

The shortlisting panel for this recruitment exercise consisted of Sam Hartley, the Secretary to the Boundary Commission for England and Tony Bellringer, the Deputy Secretary. The Commissioners were content to delegate the sifting process due to the experience and knowledge these panellists have of how a constituency review process works, particularly in relation to effective working of teams consisting of both executive staff and non executive assistant commissioners (gained directly from working on the previous review). Both have careers spanning multiple public bodies, and are therefore very familiar with the need to recognise and give due weight to transferable skills, as well as any

immediately obvious relevant experience. In addition, the Secretary to the Commission has previously run and shortlisted board-level appointments for previous employers, and the Deputy Secretary was a member of the selection panel for Assistant Commissioners at the last boundary review.

In response to your FOI request, I therefore attach the scoring sheet from the sifting exercise, which gives a breakdown of the outcome of the sifting panel's deliberations, with all entries apart from yours anonymised. I also attach a copy of the aggregated monitoring information.

If you would like to further clarify and make more precise your request relating to the information we hold on the administration and practical arrangements for running the recruitment process, discussed at the start of this response, please contact me.

Under the provisions of the FOI Act if you are dissatisfied with the response we have provided you may ask for an internal review. The BCE has a reciprocal arrangement with the Boundary Commission for Wales and in this instance you should write to:

The Secretary to the Boundary Commission for Wales,  
Ground Floor,  
Fitzalan Court,  
Cardiff,  
CF24 0BL.

If it transpires you are not content with our response or the internal review, you may apply directly to the Information Commissioner for a decision. Generally, the Information Commissioner cannot make a decision unless you have exhausted the complaints procedure provided by the BCE. The Information Commissioner can be contacted on:

The Office of the Information Commissioner,  
Wycliffe House,  
Water Lane,  
Wilmslow,  
Cheshire,  
SK9 5AF

### **Data Protection Act - Subject Access Request**

I would now like to respond to your subject access request under the Data Protection Act 1998. I can confirm the only personal data held on you are:

1. The exact application pack you submitted, which consisted of:
  - CV;
  - Supporting Evidence Form;
  - Monitoring Form - Part 1 - Political Declaration Form;
  - Monitoring Form - Part 2 - Diversity Form;
  - Monitoring Form - Part 3 - Nationality and Reference;
  - Monitoring Form - Part 4 - Declaration of Conflict of Interest Form.

2. The scoring form which was used by the sifting panel to record the scores of each candidate - as specified in response to your FOI request, an anonymised version of this is attached.

In relation to the personal data held as outlined in item 1: these are exactly as you submitted to us. If you require, we are able to return your completed application pack to you. However, due to the sensitivity of the information contained within the forms, before we can do this and in accordance with the Data Protection Act 1998 I must ask you to provide us with proof of your identity, for example a scanned copy of a valid Driving Licence or Passport. I hope you appreciate that it is our duty to safeguard personal information and we must take reasonable steps to ensure that we do not release such information erroneously.

Yours sincerely

Chris Wilcox  
Information Manager

**Boundary Commission for England** | Tel: 020 7276 1102  
35 Great Smith Street | London | SW1P 3BQ

e: [information@boundarycommissionengland.gov.uk](mailto:information@boundarycommissionengland.gov.uk)  
[boundarycommissionforengland.independent.gov.uk/](http://boundarycommissionforengland.independent.gov.uk/)